

Advertisement

washingtonpost.com > World > Middle East > The Gulf > Iraq

[Print This Article](#) [Email This Article](#) [Subscribe to The Post](#)

### RSS News Feeds



[What is RSS?](#) | [All RSS Feeds](#)

## Memo Lets CIA Take Detainees Out of Iraq

### Practice Is Called Serious Breach of Geneva Conventions

By Dana Priest

Washington Post Staff Writer

Sunday, October 24, 2004; Page A01

At the request of the CIA, the Justice Department drafted a confidential memo that authorizes the agency to transfer detainees out of Iraq for interrogation -- a practice that international legal specialists say contravenes the Geneva Conventions.

One intelligence official familiar with the operation said the CIA has used the March draft memo as legal support for secretly transporting as many as a dozen detainees out of Iraq in the last six months. The agency has concealed the detainees from the International Committee of the Red Cross and other authorities, the official said.

The draft opinion, written by the Justice Department's Office of Legal Counsel and dated March 19, 2004, refers to both Iraqi citizens and foreigners in Iraq, who the memo says are protected by the treaty. It permits the CIA to take Iraqis out of the country to be interrogated for a "brief but not indefinite period." It also says the CIA can permanently remove persons deemed to be "illegal aliens" under "local immigration law."

Some specialists in international law say the opinion amounts to a reinterpretation of one of the most basic rights of Article 49 of the Fourth Geneva Convention, which protects civilians during wartime and occupation, including insurgents who were not part of Iraq's military.

The treaty prohibits the "[i]ndividual or mass forcible transfers, as well as deportations of protected persons from occupied territory . . . regardless of their motive."

The 1949 treaty notes that a violation of this particular provision constitutes a "grave breach" of the accord, and thus a "war crime" under U.S. federal law, according to a footnote in the Justice Department draft. "For these reasons," the footnote reads, "we recommend that any contemplated relocations of 'protected persons' from Iraq to facilitate interrogation be carefully evaluated for compliance with Article 49 on a case by case basis." It says that even persons removed from Iraq retain the treaty's protections, which would include humane treatment and access to international monitors.

During the war in Afghanistan, the administration ruled that al Qaeda fighters were not considered "protected persons" under the convention. Many of them were transferred out of the country to the naval base in Guantanamo Bay, Cuba, and elsewhere for interrogations. By contrast, the U.S. government deems former members of Saddam Hussein's Baath Party and military, as well as insurgents and other civilians in Iraq, to be protected by the Geneva Conventions.

International law experts contacted for this article described the legal reasoning contained in the Justice Department memo as unconventional and disturbing.

### — Postwar Iraq —

#### — Latest News —

- [Bodies of 49 Iraqi Troops Found Dead in Eastern Iraq](#)
- [Car Bombings Kill 17 Iraqis; Attack Injures 6 U.S. Soldiers](#)
- [Memo Lets CIA Take Detainees Out of Iraq](#)
- [More Coverage](#)

### — U.S. Military Deaths —



#### Faces of the Fallen

Portraits of U.S. service members who have died in Iraq since the beginning of the war.

[an error occurred while processing this directive]

"The overall thrust of the Convention is to keep from moving people out of the country and out of the protection of the Convention," said former senior military attorney Scott Silliman, executive director of Duke University's Center on Law, Ethics and National Security. "The memorandum seeks to create a legal regime justifying conduct that the international community clearly considers in violation of international law and the Convention." Silliman reviewed the document at The Post's request.

The CIA, Justice Department and the author of the draft opinion, Jack L. Goldsmith, former director of the Office of Legal Counsel, declined to comment for this article.

CIA officials have not disclosed the identities or locations of its Iraq detainees to congressional oversight committees, the Defense Department or CIA investigators who are reviewing detention policy, according to two informed U.S. government officials and a confidential e-mail on the subject shown to The Washington Post.

White House officials disputed the notion that Goldsmith's interpretation of the treaty was unusual, although they did not explain why. "The Geneva Conventions are applicable to the conflict in Iraq, and our policy is to comply with the Geneva Conventions," White House spokesman Sean McCormick said.

The Office of Legal Counsel also wrote the Aug. 1, 2002, memo on torture that advised the CIA and White House that torturing al Qaeda terrorists in captivity abroad "may be justified," and that international laws against torture "may be unconstitutional if applied to interrogations" conducted in the war on terrorism. President Bush's aides repudiated that memo once it became public this June.

The Office of Legal Counsel writes legal opinions considered binding on federal agencies and departments. The March 19 document obtained by The Post is stamped "draft" and was not finalized, said one U.S. official involved in the legal deliberations. However, the memo was sent to the general counsels at the National Security Council, the CIA and the departments of State and Defense.

**CONTINUED** [1](#) [2](#) [Next](#) >

[Print This Article](#) [E-Mail This Article](#) [Permission to Republish](#)

© 2004 The Washington Post Company

Advertisement

#### Featured Advertiser Links

- [Free Health Newsletter](#)
- [Retire Overseas! Details & FREE Report](#)
- [Don't Accept Failing Eye Health - Free Report](#)
- [Improve Virility, Better Bodies, Better Brains](#)
- [Forget Weight Lifting, Forget Cardio](#)
- [\\$150,000 Mortgage for \\$550/Month! Click Here](#)
- [Cash Fast at a Great Low Rate with E-LOAN](#)

Advertisement

SEARCH: News

Web by  


[Top 20 E-mailed Articles](#)

© Copyright 1996- The Washington Post Company | [User Agreement and Privacy Policy](#) | [Rights and Permissions](#) | [Home](#)

**washingtonpost.com:** [Contact Us](#) | [About Us](#) | [Work at washingtonpost.com](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Media Center](#) | [Site Index](#) | [Site Map](#) | [Archives](#) | [E-mail Newsletters](#) | [RSS Feeds](#) | [Wireless Access](#) | [Our headlines on your site](#) | [Make Us Your Homepage](#) | [mywashingtonpost.com](#) **The Washington Post:** [Subscribe](#) | [Subscriber Services](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Electronic Edition](#) | [Online Photo Store](#) **The Washington Post Company:** [Information](#) | [Other Post Co. Websites](#)